



CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS
MAYOR'S OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
JOSEPH A. CURTATONE
MAYOR

MICHAEL F. GLAVIN
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DETERMINATION OF SIGNIFICANCE STAFF REPORT

| | |
|----------------------|-------------------|
| Site: | 2 Belmont Terrace |
| Case: | HPC 2014.092 |
| Applicant Name: | Philip Kramer |
| Date of Application: | October 29, 2014 |
| Recommendation: | Significant |
| Hearing Date: | November 18, 2014 |

I. Historical Association

Architectural Description: The subject structure, a c.1925 garage, is located along Belmont Terrace adjacent to 2 Belmont Terrace (c. 1850). This structure is a wood frame construction one bay in width with a hipped roof. There are two windows located on the right side facade, however, the rear and left side facade are not visible due to vegetation and the adjacent buildings. The primary façade is composed of some wood panels on either side of the garage doors while the right side facade is shingled with two one-over-one windows. Although style is difficult to determine due to the lack of architectural detail, the garage doors with glazing at the top, shallow eaves, and one-over-one window glazing, along with the late date of construction, suggest an Colonial Revival style.



2 Belmont Terrace, photo 2014

Historical Description: The subject garage is first illustrated on the 1925 Sanborn map (Sheet 41) as a one-story garage composed of wood. The building is c. 1850 and is identified on the 1852 Draper Map. A building permit from 1910 was granted to an S.Melliden to construct a pitched roof garage with brick piers. Directory research states that Susan Riker has a house at this location in 1925; she is in the dry goods business.

Context/Evolution: Belmont Terrace is situated atop an outcropping of slate; below this house, slate was quarried along Pitman Street. Belmont Terrace, located near the 19th century factories of Somerville Avenue, was originally a small unnamed passageway between Spring and Belmont streets. Both streets were platted in the late 1840s, about the same time #2 and #4 Belmont Terrace were constructed. Belmont Terrace was Belmont Court until 1925.

Summary: The c.1925 garage is a later addition to a c.1850 residence. The garage illustrates features that could be interpreted as an Colonial Revival style, which is consistent with the 1925 date of construction. The garage is more closely associated with S.Melliden, who was issued the permit for construction of the garage.

Findings on Historical Association

*For a Determination of Significance, the subject building must be found either (a) **importantly associated with people, events or history** or (b) historically or architecturally significant (Ordinance 2003-05, Section 2.17.B). Findings for (b) are at the end of the next section.*

(a) In accordance with the historic information obtained from *Findings on Historical Association*, which utilizes historic maps/atlasses, City reports and directories, and building permit research, and through an examination of resources that document the history of the City, such as *Somerville Past and Present*, Staff find the garage located at 2 Belmont Terrace to be importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City or the Commonwealth.

The subject building is found importantly associated with the broad architectural, cultural, and social history of the City due to the possible Colonial Revival style, as an example of an early 20th century wood frame garage; and as a component of the evolution of this parcel.

II. Historical and Architectural Significance

The findings for historical and/or architectural significance of a historic property address the period, style, method of building construction and association with a reputed architect or builder of the subject property, either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures (Ordinance 2003-05, Section 2.17.B).

The period of significance for the garage located at 2 Belmont Terrace begins with the c.1925 date of construction as a wood frame, single bay garage, which continues into the present day as the use of this structure remains consistent.

Integrity

The National Park Service identifies historic integrity as the ability of a property to convey significance. A property should possess sufficient integrity to convey, represent or contain the values and qualities for which it is judged significant; therefore, the following is an identification

and evaluation of these qualities and alterations as they affect the ability of the subject property to convey significance.

- a. Location:* The subject structure is located along Belmont Terrace, to the right end of the parcel. The location has not been altered and the associated dwelling is sited along the left side of the lot.
- b. Design:* The original form, massing, and fenestration pattern are still evident. The architectural detail suggests an Colonial Revival style which is not common within the City. There are several architectural features, such as the hip roof, shallow eaves, wood panel on either side of the doors, and one-over-one wood windows. The original form, design features and fenestration pattern are clear.
- c. Materials:* The materials that compose this structure are predominantly wood, with likely a brick foundation. Asphalt shingles are located on the roof.
- d. Alterations:* There are no known alterations to this building.

Evaluation of Integrity:

As a garage, the subject structure retains a moderate level of historical and architectural integrity due to the retention of the original form, materials and fenestration as well as a design that suggests the Colonial Revival style that is not common within the City.

Findings for Historical and Architectural Significance

*For a Determination of Significance, the subject building must be found either (a) importantly associated with people, events or history or (b) **historically or architecturally significant** (Ordinance 2003-05, Section 2.17.B). Findings for (a) can be found at the end of the previous section.*

(b) In accordance with the *Finding on Historical and Architectural Significance*, which addresses period, style, method of building construction, and association with a reputed architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures, as well as integrity, which assess the ability of the property to convey significance, Staff find the garage located at 2 Belmont Terrace historically or architecturally significant.

The subject dwelling is found historically and architecturally significant as a representative of an early 20th century garage, possibly of the Arts and Crafts style, due to the remaining integrity of the structure with regard to original form, massing, fenestration pattern, and material.

III. Recommendation

Recommendations are based upon an analysis by Historic Preservation Staff of the permit application and the required findings for the Demolition Review Ordinance, which requires archival and historical research, and an assessment of historical and architectural significance, conducted prior to the public meeting for a Determination of Significance. This report may be revised or updated with a new recommendation and/or findings based upon additional information provided to Staff or through further research.

For a Determination of Significance, the structure must be either (A) listed on the National Register or (B) at least 50 years old.

(A) The structure is NOT listed on or within an area listed on the National Register of Historic Places, nor is the structure the subject of a pending application for listing on the National Register.

OR

(B) The structure, c. 1925, is at least 50 years old.

AND

For a Determination of Significance under (B), the subject building must be found either (a) importantly associated with people, events or history or (b) historically or architecturally significant.

(a) In accordance with the *Findings on Historical Association*, which utilizes historic maps/atlasses, City reports and directories, and building permit research, and through an examination of resources that document the history of the City, Staff recommend that the Historic Preservation Commission find the garage located at 2 Belmont Terrace importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City or the Commonwealth.

OR

(b) In accordance with the *Findings on Historical and Architectural Significance*, which addresses period, style, method of building construction, and association with a reputed architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures, as well as integrity, the ability to convey significance, Staff recommend that the Historic Preservation Commission find the garage located at 2 Belmont Terrace historically or architecturally significant.

Garage located at 2 Belmont Terrace

